The International Journal of Learning Spaces Studies (IJLSS)

Homepage: https://journals.artahub.com/

The Iranian Ph.D. Students Experiences with Short-Term Research Courses Outside of the Home Country: A Qualitative Research

Javad Hatam[1], Mariam Shafiei Sarvestani[2], Mahboobeh Mehrvarz[3], Mohammad Hasanzadeh[4], Soleiman Ahmadi[5], Mostafa Shah Mohammadi[6], Zahra Eslami[7], Mehdi Afshar Keshavarz[8]

[1]*Professor in Educational Technology, Faculty of Humanities, Tarbiat Modares University, Tehran, Iran. j.hatami@modares.ac.ir, 0000-0002-4517-2039*

[2] *Associate Professor in Educational Planning, Shiraz University, Shiraz, Iran. maryam.shafiei@gmail.com*

[3] *Ph.D. in Educational Administration, Shiraz University, Shiraz, Iran. mehrvarzmahboobe66@yahoo.com, 0000-0001-6921-2878*

[4] *Professor, Knowledge and Information Science, Knowledge Management, Tarbiat Modares University, Tehran, Iran. hasanzadeh@modares.ac.ir, 0000-0002-6175-0855*

[5] *Professor of Medical Education, Department of Medical Education, Shaid Beheshti University of Medical Sciences, Tehran, Iran. soleiman.ahmady@sbmu.ac.ir, 0000-0003-0551-6068*

[6] *PhD Candidate, Industrial Design, University of Lisbon, Lisbon, Portugal. shahmohammadiid@gmail.com*

[7] *PhD in Educational Assessment, University of Tehran, Tehran, Iran. eslamiz59@gmail.com*

[8] *Assistant Professor, Art Studies, Tarbiat Modares University, Tehran, Iran. m.afshar@modares.ac.ir*

ARTICLE INFO

ABSTRACT

Purpose: This study aimed to identify the effective factors in the effectiveness of short-term research courses abroad for Ph.D. students inside.

Method: This qualitative research has been carried out focusing on conventional content analysis. The study population includes all specialized doctoral students in the country who have completed short courses of research abroad. By Stratified cluster sampling to the saturation level of the data, 18 people were studied. The tool used to gather information was a semi-structured interview.

Findings: Based on the main and sub-themes, and considering the 100% positive effect on students' personal, professional and cultural development, the need to continue short-term research courses abroad was explained and the need for special attention of policymakers and decision-makers of higher education to this opportunity and redesign these courses based on the management experience of previous years and the lived experiences of students revealed. Redesign the services students need to send them abroad, using more effective management measures, providing the necessary funding and support, strengthening Internet communication infrastructure and the possibility of faster and higher-quality access to the world's scientific centers and the restoration and placement of human and social values in the context of academic discourse was achieved.

Conclusion: International experience in higher education is the most important factor. Therefor, student exchange is the suitable path for developing and improving of lived experience of students in higher education especially in post-graduate courses. ©**authors**

1. Introduction

Organizations are seen as the subsystems of society, created to meet the needs of society; and in this regard, they receive the necessary resources from society, and they provide the goods produced and their services to society as feedback. The dynamism of societies requires that their needs be constantly changed and obliges organizations to meet these needs to adapt to social needs in terms of structure, quantity, and quality. In this regard, the human resources of organizations that has taken over and used other resources, play an important role in performing this task. The knowledge of experts and specialists about the necessity and importance of human resources in organizations has created a discourse of improving the performance and maintenance of human resources and the role of education in it and for most organizations; it has been proven that the development of organizations is not separate from educational support. Therefore, addressing issues of sustainability from the local to the global scale and in geographical and cultural areas has become an important issue for the sustainability of research and education. (Trencher et al, 2014); In fact, higher education institutions today include sustainability concepts in their programs (Ruhanen & Bowles, 2019; Zizka & Varga, 2020) and, as an educational-research organization, have the mission of preparing young professionals at different levels (Zeegers & Clark, 2014). In this way, if higher education fulfills its responsibilities well, it can turn young graduates who believe in lifelong learning into active members of society (Renfors, Veliverronena & Grinfelde, 2020); People whose values and skills play an important role in the advancement of knowledge and society. In general, graduate students, especially Ph.D. students, are the source of this innovation, research, and productivity in today's world community, knowledge, and economics (Al-Kumaim et al, 2020).

Therefore, paying attention to doctoral students and knowing their needs for the advancement of knowledge in today's society is one of the most important issues; due to globalization in the 21st century, many jobs seek to employ people with special skills who can compete in the international arena. To have (Atalar, 2020), Therefore, university students, as people who will soon enter the job market, should be able to interact with people with different cultures and backgrounds. Universities must prepare their students for such a global environment; they must prepare their students for global citizenship. For this purpose, in the doctoral program, an opportunity has been provided for students for short-term research courses, with the help of which students can go to the scientific environments of other universities abroad. And through communication with new educational and research environments and being within the borders of science, increase the level of their scientific knowledge and skills, and through this, develop their individual, professional and scientific attitudes; Some researchers believe that university academic experiences play an essential role in students' academic sustainability and the intellectual, social, and emotional well-being (Audenaert et al, 2014). As a result, it increases the effectiveness of doctoral graduates to meet the current needs of society and the university; Transferring students to other countries in the process of internationalization of higher education has advantages such as personal and academic growth, change of perspective, sense of value and independence, as well as the development of new social and academic skills of students (Ploner, 2018). Therefore, sending doctoral students to short-term research courses in other countries promotes cultural competencies and expands their thinking (Wihlborg et al., 2018) and also prepares them for the job market and the current world. However, the implementation of this operation has many challenges and also requires scientific, political and cultural planning and strategies (Thalib, 2015).

Therefore, if the officials of the Ministry of Science, the Office of Expedition, are not able to keep pace with the changes in internationalization in the present era and invest the resources properly; not only will they cause dissatisfaction among the audience and reduce their

credibility at the community level, but they will have to leave the field to other competitors. Therefore, one of the most important issues facing the Office of Student Exchange, like other institutions sending students abroad, according to the cost of educational expenses is: providing effective training, determining the effectiveness of educational courses and evaluating the improvement of students' performance according to their participation in these courses. Interviews with Ph.D. students who have the experience of using these study opportunities, also being aware of their satisfaction, needs and wants during this period, can reveal to us the effectiveness of these courses; because interviewing students who have used international study opportunities and being aware of their needs and wants during this time can help us maintain students and make these courses more effective (Roga, Lapiņa & Müürsepp, 2015).On the other hand, the result of education is not limited to the desired goals; it also includes a range of obvious and invisible benefits; Therefore, identifying the effectiveness of such courses in higher education has been the main issue of this study and its main purpose is to determine the effective factors in the effectiveness of short-term research courses outside the country of doctoral students in the country. These training courses have had educational consequences for students, including cultural and descriptive teachings on the amount of knowledge learned by students during the research course abroad. The amount of skills learned by participating students in these courses, the amount of use of skills learned by students, the amount and manner of formation of students' scientific attitudes during the research period abroad and individual and organizational barriers to the process of passing the course.

Higher education, like other organizations, spends large sums of money annually to teach specific skills. However, their effectiveness has not been measured as desired and the feedback system has provided very scattered and irregular or inappropriate feedback and this size of undesirable and unfair perceptions and evaluations can be a potential obstacle to further development of science (Elango, Kozak & Rajendran, 2019). In other words, designing and implementing educational and research programs is usually costly, and managers and policymakers will not have a clear understanding of it if trustees fail to prove the effectiveness of education in the form of regular reports. And despite verbal support for education and its importance, it is not considered a sufficient budget in practice and is usually categorized as organizational costs; therefore, it is necessary to evaluate the level of educational assistance in achieving the goals of the university by using the scientific method and present its results qualitatively and quantitatively.

2. Literature Review

Today, universities face many demands and challenges (Buchem et al., 2018). One of the issues facing higher education institutions is sending students in the process of internationalization of higher education to other countries and benefiting from the benefits of international and educational study opportunities in other universities (Tur et al., 2018); In other words, higher education institutions must strive to sustainable in the current competitive world (Durkin & McKenna, 2011; Wu & Naidoo, 2016; Bradford, 2015; Minola, Donina & Meoli, 2016) and move towards the phenomenon of internationalization to reply the needs of students and the scientific environment in the current competitive environment (Gajić, 2012). One of the most important indicators of the internationalization of higher education is student mobility (Lee & Kuzhabekova, 2018; Otto, 2018). And higher education institutions should try to meet the internationalization process and transfer students to other universities abroad to reply to the needs of students because one of the needs of Ph.D. students is to take advantage of Short-term research courses during their studies. Student study opportunities are defined as "collaborative activities - at least - two higher education institutions"; Two or more institutions agree to allow their students to earn several privileges at a partner university or through joint ventures. The scores of this international experience are then calculated in the student's degree

at the university of origin. Valtins & Muracova (2019) stated in a study that students' study periods are called "free movement"; the use of university-related programs allows students to enter the university for one semester or one academic year under a bilateral agreement (Teresevičienė, Volungevičienė & Daukšienė, 2011). It is clear that attracting students to endure, endure and eventually thrive is important for universities and puts them in competitive and new dynamics. (Cattaneo et al, 2019).

One of the important criteria in ensuring the success of these study courses in the evaluation of study courses to ensure that the cost and time spent on these courses have been effective. Research has shown that without an educational assessment mechanism, some students will not be able to use their professional knowledge in specific situations when graduating; they cannot master new knowledge, and without the ability to think independently, it will be difficult for them to form judgment and insight (Li et al, 2019). And in some other research, it has been stated that in the university system, research performance is usually the basis for progress and entrepreneurship for those who need to evaluate academic units, including universities, departments, and researchers (Yang & Lee, 2018). As the role of educational evaluation, as well as study courses at the university, becomes more prominent, the effective evaluation of study courses can be examined using the experiences of students who have used this course. Appiah-Kubi & Annan's (2020) experimental studies concluded that direct observation of others from the host culture, student interviews, and case studies are assessment methods that are unanimously approved by university administrators involved in internationalization programs to measure acceptable organizational satisfaction. Another study looked at the criteria used by Peruvian students to choose universities abroad. The study concluded that Peruvian students generally seek to meet their needs for improvement, and success to achieve Professional and personal skills, free tuition and fees, and the quality of education. The study, which looked at the results of students 'attitudes toward foreign programs in Norway, found that the image of the host institution, the safety and convenience of the destination, and the international capacity of the destination country, had a significant and positive effect on the choice of universities by students. Also, the attitude towards studying abroad depends to a large extent on the mechanisms of support, as well as the cultural and social image of that country (Wu & Naidoo, 2016). Despite extensive research on the effectiveness of short-term research courses through interviews and surveys with students who have experienced participation in these courses, research that examines and evaluates the simultaneous effectiveness of students' experiences of participating in study courses in different continents, was scarce; Therefore, the present study examines the effectiveness of short-term research courses abroad by specialized doctoral students inside.

3. Method

This research has been done with a qualitative approach and conventional content analysis. And an attempt has been made to gain an understanding of their experiences based on the words and expressions of the participants. The population under study in this study includes all specialized doctoral students in the country who have completed short-term research courses. Sampling was based on stratified cluster sampling and the sample size was determined based on the data reaching theoretical saturation. After extracting the sample list, individuals were classified based on continent and educational groups, and an attempt was made to select individuals from each continent in the humanities, basic sciences, medical sciences, agricultural sciences, and engineering disciplines. The tool used to collect information was a semi-structured interview. To conduct the interview and to guide it toward research goals, the researchers used an interview guide that included open-ended and guiding questions toward participants' understanding of the experience and perspective of the short-term research course abroad. For this purpose, 18 people were interviewed. The selected content unit was to extract

the data needed for the research, the sentences and the statements of the participants. Using qualitative content analysis, the researcher extracted meaningful codes and coded them separately for each participant. In the process of data reduction, some of the sentences in the second category reached the main theme, while in many cases, the sentences reached the main theme after the two-way disclosure of the sub-themes. The whole research process lasted from the initial studies to the approval of the plan and the completion of data analysis and presentation of the results for 11 months.

4. Findings

In order to understand the implicit concepts expressed by the participants, the qualitative data obtained from the interviews (18 people) were analyzed with qualitative content. A total of 18 semi-structured interviews lasted about 10 hours and 40 minutes and were implemented on more than 184 A4 sheets of paper. What emerged after implementation and coding; there were 659 significant and important data codes that after several data readings, reported on the lived experience of the participants in the study. The participants in the study were 7 women and 11 men, 8 of whom were married at the time of the mission, 9 of whom were single, and one of whom was engaged at the time of the engagement. The minimum stay was 3 months and 20 days and the maximum stay was one year and 5 months. Five of the participants in the United States, four in Australia, three in Germany, two in Japan and one in Malaysia, Singapore, Italy and one of the participants in France, had life experience and a research course in that country.

From the 18 interviews and 659 meaningful codes extracted, 599 codes were revealed in line with the research objective and 60 significant codes were revealed as not obvious findings. From the 599 significant codes, 193 codes belonged to the European continent, 170 codes to the American continent, 130 codes to the Asian continent and 106 codes to the Australian continent. During the data analysis process, 599 codes were reduced to 112 sub-themes and then to 6 main themes. In the process of data reduction, the categorization of the findings was based on continental segregation, according to which 193 significant continental European codes were reduced to 24 sub-themes. From the 170 significant codes of the Americas, 32 sub-themes was obtained, from the 130 significant codes of the Asian, 29 sub-theme was obtained, and from the106 significant codes of the Australian continent, 27 sub-theme was obtained, and finally, from all sub-theme, six main themes were obtained. These include the process of passing the course, Individual and professional development, Cultural development, the value and benefits of origin's country, the necessity of continual courses and offers. A total of 60 codes from the extracted codes described the status quo of the research subject from the perspective of the participants, who were excluded from the analysis process due to their inconsistency with the research objectives along with the main content of the proposals. However, due to the significance of this type of code, they have been used in the discussion and outcome process.

4.1. Asia

There were 130 significant codes in this group, and in the first phase of the reduction, 29 sub-themes were revealed, and after studying and examining the relationship between the sub-themes, six main themes were extracted.

4.1.1. The process of passing the course

All participants spoke to their professors via the Internet and email. One of the participants met with his professor at the attending scientific conferences and contacted him by e-mail when he applied for a study opportunity (Code Asia02). Another participant, through the prestigious International Scientific Association in his field of specialization, found the desired professor

and he also contacted the selected professor by e-mail. (Asia04). One of the sub-themes in the main theme of the course process was the satisfaction of the scientific quality of the selected professor during and after the course. Three of the participants were 100% satisfied with their teacher. (Asia01, Asia02 and Asia04 codes), and one person, who used the research course as an independent researcher, did not have a clear idea of the quality of the professor, stating that "I worked for myself." (Asia03). Under the theme of Allocation of time by the professor for the student, three participants stated that the professor had given them enough time (codes Asia01, Asia02, and Asia04) and one spoke about the busy schedule of the professor (Code Asia03). all participants were 100% satisfied with their travel and living conditions during the period, and only one participant spoke about the incompatibility weather with the climate of the country and the city of their residence, which required more time to coordinate. Of course, he was also very satisfied with his life and the experience of traveling to that country. (Asia04). Under the theme, the desire to revisit; two participants were eager to revisit the same research and academic center they had gone to (Asia01 and Asia02 codes). Two other participants were reluctant to return to the same research center; one preferred to travel to continental Europe because of the distance traveled, and was keen to experience a variety of new research centers (Code Asia03). Another participant preferred to travel to a country with similar weather conditions to Iran due to the weather conditions in the destination country. (Code Asia04).The next theme that reveals the main theme of the course process is the concept of the Ministry of Science, Research and Technology. Participants reported long-term problems with the Ministry of Science's administrative process for obtaining support funding, lack of funding in the Ministry of Science, failure to pay travel allowance, payment of ticket costs long after return, and disregard for the cost of living. Two of the participants were satisfied with the Ministry of Science and its support (Asia02 and Asia03 codes).

4.1.2. Individual and professional development

The main themes of Individual and professional development were revealed from the sub-themes like knowledge, professional skills, skills learned at the University of Origin, foreign language, professional life skills, self-confidence and self-confidence, and recognition of one's strengths and weaknesses. All participants reported a positive effect on increasing their specialized knowledge. Participants spoke about the difference in the level of destination universities with Iranian universities, stating that destination universities are moving on the frontier of knowledge and are fully benefiting from the knowledge of the day and they are very sensitive to progress. There, the researcher freely researches various topics and their international activities inform about modern knowledge in the world, and all these cases have caused the participants in the present study to agree on the 100% positive effect on their specialized knowledge. Give. Professional skills were another sub-topic of Individual and professional development, in which 100% of the participants spoke about the positive impact of this course on increasing their professional skills, as they became familiar with new techniques and provided more confidence in their specialized skills. At the same time, the participants believed that the level of skills learned at the University of Origin would affect the quality of learning; and, of course, they believed that the theoretical level of the universities of origin was good. Regarding the sub-theme of the foreign language, all participants stated that the English language had a great impact on their foreign language learning, and motivated to promote their foreign language. All participants believed that this course had an impact on their professional lives and was very useful. Also, this period has caused the self-confidence of the participants in scientific work to increase and they have good self-confidence.

4.1.3. Cultural development

This theme became apparent from the sub-themes of cultural influences and positive scientific attitudes. The lived experience of all participants showed the cultural impact of the destination countries. The cultural interactions that took place for the participants, and the emergence of human and moral values in the destination countries, were so influential that one of the participants used the concept of culture shock. He stated that the people of the destination country were socially at a higher level than the country of origin. Another sub-theme that revealed cultural development was the concept of a positive scientific attitude, which all participants acknowledged as an opportunity to study and promote their positive scientific attitude.

4.1.4. The value and benefits of origin's country

This main theme was revealed from the sub-themes, respect for human values, social security, the value of science, sharing scientific information, planning, motivating scientific space, the possibility of progress and promotion, university facilities and industrial support. All participants referred to concepts that reflected values such as respect for human beings and their human dignity, sincere relationships, humanity, honesty and integrity of action and commitment, which revealed the content of current values in the destination country. The facilities that the university provides to researchers, along with industrial support and scientific space, create a sense in the researcher that he can always do a better job and make more progress.

4.1.5. The necessity of continual courses and offers

All participants in this section spoke about the need to continue short-term research courses and their importance. By stating the need for international exchanges, the participants considered the experiences gained in the study opportunity to be more than all the experiences of studying at the destination university.

4.2. Europe

193 significant codes were extracted in this group; in the first stage of reduction, 27 sub-themes were revealed and after studying and examining the relationship between sub-themes, six main themes were extracted.

4.2.1. The process of passing the course

How to get acquainted with the master was one of the sub-themes that emerged in the process of passing the course. Two of the participants became acquainted with the professor of the destination university through direct scientific cooperation with the professor of the University of Origin. (Eu01 and Eu02 codes).

The rest of the participants identified the professor via the Internet and their articles and then communicated them by e-mail. Satisfaction with the academic quality of the professor and the destination university were other sub-topics that all participants were 100% satisfied with their professor, and phrases such as "they were great, both in terms of knowledge and guidance and social relationships" (Code Eu04). Or "they knew their job very well" (code Eu03).Three other participants believed that the destination university professor had spent enough time for them, and he was available most of the time. All participants were satisfied with the travel and living in the destination country. All the participants except one of them agreed with the theme "I would like to return to the university or destination research institute"; and only one person stated that "I would like to take the opportunity to study elsewhere" (code Eu03).The next sub-topic with the highest number of extracted codes is the Ministry of Science, Research and Technology sub-topic. Two of the participants, while expressing satisfaction with the support

of the Ministry of Science, expressed statements such as "If you want the truth, I was not bothered much" (Eu03). Other participants revealed problems with the Ministry of Science's support funding process and visa requirements. These sub-topics include extracting phrases such as "It was a disaster", "2 months of our lives were lost in this administrative process", "Most of the time I was waiting for signature", "It was very scary"(code Eu01); These cases revealed the sub-themes of the financial problems of the Ministry of Science. in some cases, the late payment of the researcher's ticket would indicate a long time after returning to the country; For example, "They didn't give us the ticket money, I got the ticket money 3 years after returning to Iran " (code Eu01). One participant expressed dissatisfaction with the restriction on choosing an airline to buy tickets said, "We must have used the Iran Air flight" (code Eu02), and expressed dissatisfaction. In one case, the participant referred to the lack of accreditation of the Ministry of Science, which did not give credit to the scholarship letter, Because the embassy of the destination country in Iran was informed that the Ministry of Science was not able to provide financial support, they did not provide credit for the scholarship letter. One participant spoke of the disproportionate financial support based on the cost of different cities and countries; "It's not usually a well-organized scholarship ... for example, "someone who goes to a small town in Germany where the total cost of living is 5,000 euros, gets 5,000 euros financial support, and his amount is the same with someone who goes to an expensive city " (code Eu02). Another of the codes extracted, showed a low level of support from the Ministry of Science, with participants stating that "the Ministry of Science does not give us much (sufficient) money" (Code Eu03).

4.2.2. Individual and professional development

The main themes of Individual and professional development were revealed under the topics of specialized knowledge, professional skills, skills learned at the University of Origin, foreign language, professional life skills, self-confidence, and recognition of one's strengths and weaknesses. All participants spoke about the positive impact of these short-term research courses on increasing their specialized knowledge; and with sub-topics such as "being in the context of research, understanding the preferences of research, being on the frontiers of research in increasing knowledge, and having the opportunity to improve", the main theme of specialized knowledge became apparent. Also, all participants in the European group spoke about the positive impact of this study period on increasing their professional skills and stated that it has increased their self-confidence. The next sub-topic revealed the status of the source skills; and based on the experience of four participants, the skills learned at the university of origin were sufficient, and only one person mentioned that "the university of origin was theoretically good, but in terms of practical skills we do not learn anything in the university" (Code Eu03) The university's skills were not sufficient. Regarding the sub-theme of the foreign language, all participants stated that it had a great impact on their foreign language learning, and motivated them to improve their foreign language.

4.2.3. Cultural development

This theme became apparent from the sub-themes of cultural influences and positive scientific attitudes. Based on the lived experience, all participants in the study during the study period were affected by the cultural conditions of the destination countries. One of the participants stated that the researcher is gradually becoming part of the culture of the destination country (Code Eu01), And the opportunity to study is the gateway to participation in world culture, and by changing the worldview of the researcher and creating a positive scientific attitude, it creates a platform for understanding the culture of other countries and developing cultural relations between countries.

4.2.4. The value and benefits of origin's country

This main theme was revealed from the sub-themes of the concepts and factors that influenced the researcher. Values such as social security and low crime rates, freedom, respect for beliefs and beliefs, humanity, honesty, and hospitality caused the values of the destination country. On the other hand, communication with industry, perseverance and team spirit, order and effort to do things right and access to educational resources and progress are some of the benefits that foreign researchers can benefit from, according to the contributors.

4.2.5. The necessity of continual courses and offers

All of the participants in this section spoke about the need to continue short-term research courses and their importance. Participants spoke about the need for short-term research courses for faculty members and the importance of introducing the country's scientific environment.

4.3. Australia

There were 106 significant codes in this group, which in the first stage of reduction, 31 sub-themes were revealed, and after studying and examining the relationship between sub-themes, six main themes were extracted.

4.3.1. The process of passing the course

All participants have communicated with the professors of the destination country via the Internet and via e-mail. Three of the participants expressed satisfaction with the academic quality of their teacher (Austo02, Aust03, Aust04 codes), and only one of the participants mentioned the phrase, "My destination university professor was not at the level I thought I was, or what I expected" (Aust01 code), stating that his expectations were not met. All participants in the Australian section stated that the professor had spent enough time for them. For example, "University professors spent a lot of time with us, we had very good meetings with them" (Aust03 code). All participants were satisfied with their living and travel conditions, and this sub-theme became clear based on the following phrases: "The Short-Term Research courses of my studies were excellent, that is, I looked at it as a dream" (Code Aust01), "Travel and life in Australia were excellent" (Aust03). All participants spoke of a desire to return to their chosen destination. For example, "I miss Australia so much that I miss my homeland" (code Aust01), "Of course I want to go to that department again" (code Aust03), "Yes if the opportunity arises, I will use this opportunity" (Aust04 code). The next sub-topic is the concept of services of the Ministry of Science, Research and Technology during the short-term research courses. One participant was satisfied with the statement, stating that "there was almost no particular problem" (Aust02 code).Three participants (Aust01, Aust03, Aust04) expressed dissatisfaction with the service. Sub-topics the university's deterrent bureaucracy, lack of foreign exchange credit from the Ministry of Science, poor financial support, lack of a positive view of the humanities, lack of transparency and ambiguity in the stock market process in the Ministry of Science, revealed dissatisfaction with the Ministry of Science's services. For example, "I had a lot of problems with the bureaucratic system of the Ministry of Science" (code Aust01), "mostly the work we did with the Ministry of Science was done badly" (Aust03 code). "When I got the visa, the Ministry of Science didn't have credit, it also didn't have the money to send me; when the money and credit were prepared by the Ministry of Science, my visa expired, so I waited six months to get a second visa, and that was very annoying." (Aust01Code).

4.3.2. Individual and professional development

The main theme of Individual and professional development, under the themes of increasing specialized knowledge, increasing professional skills, the status of skills learned at the university of origin, Influence on foreign language, the rise in professional life skills

became apparent. All participants reported a positive effect on increasing their specialized knowledge; and that in a short time; they have increased their awareness and literacy throughout their university years; For example: "These study periods have had a 100% effect on increasing knowledge" (Aust03 code). All participants also noted the great impact of short-term research courses abroad on the researcher's specialized skills, and some have even argued that the course's impact on increasing professional skills has been as great as it has been throughout their college years; as mentioned below, the increase in specialized knowledge was also mentioned. For example, "If I didn't have this experience, I wouldn't be able to attend international forums and conferences many times". "My serious participation in these conferences was due to my presence in the study opportunity" (Aust01 code), "It was very effective in increasing my scientific skills; the course of my studies, I think, was worth as much as my entire education" (Aust03). "If I hadn't gone through that period, I probably wouldn't have thought of an English article at all, that is, the concept of an English article there changed for me" (Code Aust04). Regarding the content of the adequacy of the skills learned at the university of origin, three participants (codes Aust01, Aust03, Aust04) believed that the skills were not sufficient; For example, "Skills learned at the University of Origin were useful, but not sufficient, because the educational experience there is different" (Aust01code), "In our country, we read most of the discussions theoretically, and the emphasis is on the practical aspect of the weak courses, but in the study groups, the destination country's university emphasizes the practical dimension" (Aust04 code); However, one of the participants suggested that the skills learned at the university were sufficient (Aust02 code). All participants spoke about the positive impact of study opportunities on their learning and foreign language level. All participants also believed that the short-term research courses abroad had a positive and beneficial effect on their professional lives.

4.3.3. Cultural development

This theme was revealed in the sub-themes of cultural interactions and positive scientific attitudes. All participants spoke about the positive impact of study opportunities on positive scientific attitudes and cultural interactions and the short-term research course abroad leads to intercultural understanding. For example: "The meetings and conversations I had with these people (people from other countries) have been very effective in creating these intercultural understandings; I got the culture of those countries" (Aust01 code).

4.3.4. The value and benefits of origin's country

This main theme is obtained from the sub-themes of up to date facilities, Quality resources and easy access to them, applied research, International Communications, Communication with the market and society and conduct research without hindrance, the presence of lovable people and the favorable atmosphere of scientific work became apparent. Two contributors (Aust01 and Aust03 codes) talked about up to date facilities and reputable resources that could be easily accessed; and that in an environment conducive to scientific work, in which the research approach is applicable, research can be conducted as to meets the needs of society. In addition, lovable people and international communication provide the basis for the emergence of human values and the development of international relations. For example, "We have been told that there is no obstacle to scientific research and that the whole university system is at your service to help you get the job done" (Aust01 code).

4.3.5. The necessity of continual courses and offers

All participants spoke of the need to continue these courses and emphasized them. One participant believed that taking a short-term research course abroad was one of the factors in hired the academic board. "I think that anyone who wants to work in Iran as a faculty member

will not be able to do so without such opportunities" (Aust01). Another participant considered it necessary to take study opportunities to succeed in the doctoral program. "A doctoral student who didn't have the opportunity to study abroad, cannot be a successful doctoral student at all" (Aust03). In addition to expressing the need to continue the course, one of the participants spoke about the choice of people with insight to use the study opportunity (Aust02 code).

4.4. America

170 significant codes were extracted in this group; in the first stage of the reduction, 52 obvious sub-themes were extracted, and after studying and examining the relationship between sub-themes, six main themes were extracted.

4.4.1. The process of passing the course

The way the student became acquainted with the university professor was one of the sub-themes that emerged in the process of passing the course. All participants used the Internet to communicate with the professors of the destination countries. All participants were satisfied with the scientific quality of the destination teacher, and their expectations were met; For example: "My expectations were met and in many ways better than the Iranians" (Amc01 code). All participants stated that the destination professors had sufficient time to guide the researcher. For example: "I met with him every week and was fully guided by him" (Amc04 code), "They gave me time and didn't give it to anyone else at all when they specified it for me" (Amc05 code). All participants were satisfied with the trip and life in the United States; for example, "I was very pleased that if I did not have a nationalist spirit, I would never return to Iran" (Amc01 code). All participants were willing to return to their destination country and university. Only one participant stated that he or she was interested in returning to the destination city but would like to experience another university (Amc05 code).

4.4.2. Individual and professional development

The main themes of Individual and professional development extract under the themes of specialized knowledge, professional skills, skills learned at the university of origin, foreign language, Professional life skills, self-esteem and self-confidence, and the recognition of his weaknesses and strengths. All participants reported a positive effect on their increased knowledge and with sub-themes such as: being on the borders of science and familiarity with today's resources, they spoke about the positive impact of short-term research courses abroad on increasing specialized knowledge. For example: "They are working scientifically on the frontiers of science" (Amc03 code). All participants on the topic: Scientific skills also stated that it had a positive effect on increasing their professional skills, and it has given him confidence in himself and participate in scientific discussions. On the content of adequate skills learned at the University of Origin, three participants believed that these skills were sufficient and even in one case; the professor of the destination university has been surprised. For example, "My teacher was astonished, saying that I did not think that the Iranians would be so capable and with such perseverance" (Amc03 code). One person stated that the skills were not sufficient; For example, "No, the skills of the university of origin were very limited; the only thing that suitable for me was my studies; they didn't teach us special skills in Iran, as I was a student" (Amc01 code). One participant considered part of the skills sufficient and believed that he had not learned some other of the skills (Amc05 code). All participants spoke about the positive impact of study opportunities on their professional lives.

4.4.3. Cultural development

This theme became apparent from the sub-themes creating a positive scientific attitude, and influencing cultural interactions. According to all participants, short-term research courses

abroad have had a positive impact on the cultural development of researchers and their interactions. For example, one of the participants stated that the behavior of the knowledge sharing of researchers in the destination country was so good: "Usually there, everyone shares all their knowledge and findings and has a great impact on a positive scientific attitude" (Amc01 code).

4.4.4. The value and benefits of origin's country

Concepts such as respect for human beings, Human value, Value for science, Intimacy, Respect for people's personal space, the freedom, feeling comfortable reading, Ability to achieve goals, Sense of intellectual security, Respect the opinions of others, Ethics, Feelings of altruism, democracy create the sub-theme of disclosed the values perceived by the researcher in the destination country. For example, "People there have a lot of respect for humans." "You feel a lot of respect, which means I never thought a human being would be so valuable" (Amc01 Code), "You learn that your culture is important for yours, you shouldn't give up on your ideas and at the same time, you respect their opinions" (Amc02 code). On the other hand, the facilities and resources were provided to researchers by the university day and night; and the value of research in those countries, along with the holding of congresses and the connection with the scientific community of the world, accompanied by a team spirit, create the sub-theme of the value and benefits of origin's country for the guest researcher. For example: "Everything was easily available there / a substance that takes us at least 2 to 3 months to get to us. Well, today we order to go to our desk tomorrow to work with it" (Amc02 code).

4.4.5. The necessity of continual courses and offers

All participants in this section spoke about the necessity of continual courses and offers and their importance. Participants spoke of the need to continue short-term research courses abroad and they see it as a great opportunity to interact with other universities and strengthen the universities of origin, through this connection and to reach the level of the world's universities. For example, "We have a lot of weaknesses in our universities, and we can solve some of those weaknesses by connecting with other developed universities" (Amc01 code).

5. Discussion

In order to summarize the findings of the qualitative study, and to better understand the identified themes, all 112 extracted codes which were analyzed in terms of continental classification, were all re-analyzed together. The main six themes remained unchanged and one class was exposed to the previous classes and before the main themes class was revealed. This class consists of 26 sub-themes, which in fact, these sub-themes and the main themes have identified an important part of the evaluation criteria for short-term research courses abroad, which have been the result of the lived experience of the participants.

The most important platform for students to communicate with professors and researchers at universities abroad is the Internet, using email. One of the first steps in the process of passing courses is to have the right context for communication with the least disturbance and the highest speed. In this regard, Starck & Zadeh (2013) states that one of the communication factors for attracting and registering students' names has been the role of the Internet and information and communication technology, which includes equipment such as web pages, e-mail, videos and virtual conferences, Which facilitates the transfer and mobility of programs and information. In a study, Bason, May & LaFountaine (2018) stated that easy access and online technologies in the process of internationalization allow students to move faster than usual. Research has also shown that to accelerate the process of internationalization, university classrooms and spaces must be equipped with the most advanced and up-to-date technology and communication equipment (Lee & Park, 2017; Mehrvarz et al, 2019). Some researchers

emphasize the importance of today's emerging technologies, such as the MOOCs and model system, and its effect on the process of internationalization (Wu & Zha, 2018; Wihlborg et al., 2018). Therefore, attention to new technologies and the Internet is very fruitful in the effectiveness of the process of study courses. There was no particular dissatisfaction with the Internet service on the subject of how to get acquainted with the professor, but the need to strengthen the Internet communication infrastructure and provide faster and better access to the world's scientific centers and resources is one of the key issues for higher education decision-makers.

Most of the participants were satisfied with the scientific quality of the foreign professors, which can be attributed to the correct selection of the students sent. Of course, this can also be a sign of the difference between the level of domestic professors and universities and professors of foreign destinations and universities. In the research, some of the indicators of university quality assessment include students 'scientific results, professors' teaching quality, research quality and international collaborations (Pigini & Staffolani, 2016). Many studies consider the satisfaction of university educational quality as one of the factors influencing the choice of a university by foreign students; Liu, Kamnuansilpa & Hirofumi (2018), for example, in a study entitled "Factors Affecting International Students 'Decisions on Choosing a Destination for Study Abroad: A Case Study of China", showed that the educational quality is one of the first factors that influence students' choice of the foreign university. Also, De Oliveira & Soares (2016) conducted a qualitative study with 298 international students at a public university in northern Portugal, concluding that academic credibility and university quality are the most important factors in attracting students to the destination university. Similarly, in an interview with two groups of 17 people, Gong & Huybers (2015) identified only two key factors that influence students' choice of an international educational destination university rankings and destination safety; In general, research (Wu & Naidoo, 2016; Bodycott, 2009) confirms the quality of university education on the selection of international students is important. In general, the professors of the destination universities generally spent enough time for the students, except for the cases in Asia and Europe where the professor referred the student to an assistant due to his busy schedule, the process of passing the course was stated.

The satisfaction of all participants with the experience of traveling and living in the countries they visited can be an indication of the favorable living conditions in the destination countries, which has led to a satisfying living experience for the participants. It may be part of the desire for most participants to return to their destination universities.

The "Services of the Ministry of Science" was the subject of most dissatisfaction with the course, Ministry of Science where all student credit and support services are provided. Ph.D. students need financial and credit support to conduct their research, and in particular, in terms of financial support, the Ministry of Science has a significant role to play in increasing the satisfaction of participants. The only sub-theme in the main theme of the "course process", in which the dissatisfaction of the participants was expressed to others, is the "services of the Ministry of Science". Hildén (2011) points out the importance of tuition fees in choosing a destination country to study: High tuition fees abroad are a complex decision for students to choose. Also, the results of Liu et al (2018) show that tuition fees are the second most effective factor in choosing foreign students from the destination university. In general, many studies such as (Reiner, Meyer & Sardadvar, 2017; Lee, 2017; Ahmad & Buchanan, 2016; Jiani, 2017; Owens & Loomes, 2010; Mazzarol & Soutar, 2002), the amount of tuition costs as one of the important factors in choosing The destination university is considered by international students. Therefore, it is possible to redesign the services needed by students to send and use study opportunities, use better management measures, provide the necessary funding and financial support, and update the structure and process of providing the necessary services to send students to short research courses abroad, Increased the satisfaction of student in these courses.

One hundred percent positive effect on personal and professional development, which is achieved through being on the frontiers of knowledge, familiarity with new scientific and research skills, improving professional life skills, increasing self-confidence and recognizing one's position; could be one of the main reasons why Ph.D. students are willing to take advantage of study opportunities abroad. Peruvian students cited criteria such as meeting their needs to improve and achieve professional and personal success and benefiting from the quality of education to help them pursue career opportunities or further study (Rivera, 2019). Research has shown that transferring students to other countries, in the process of internationalization of higher education, has advantages such as personal and academic growth; change of perspective, sense of value and independence, as well as the development of new social and academic skills of students (Ploner, 2018). Spiro & Jane (2014) also showed in a study that attending courses that foster intercultural confrontation can foster students with higher levels of intercultural awareness, understanding, and empathy. In this regard, the findings of Daquila's study (2013) state that government policies for the internationalization of higher education have been designed implemented and reviewed and approved. Improving students' attitudes and values, including intercultural awareness and commitment, stimulating competition and global citizenship through global curricula to achieve human resources has been considered in this policy. Research has shown that international students lack the skills to manage their learning experience. These range from language proficiency to the inability to understand intercultural competencies or participation in projects that lead to student independence (Ploner, 2018). Therefore, the professional development and growth of students' awareness have been one of the needs of students in passing short-term study courses, and these goals have been in line with the goals of human development of the University Organization and the Ministry of Science; and through the personal and professional development of doctoral students, one can expect more effective universities.

It should be noted that one of the effects of these courses is to improve the English language level of Ph.D. students, which can be used to provide the manpower needed by universities to move towards the third generation university that one of its features is English language courses. Therefore, students are required to work in multicultural teams and speak other languages to interact with others, and this has created a major challenge for universities (Pouromid, 2019).Also, many universities offer second or third language courses, to make their graduates multilingual (Atalar, 2020).On the other hand, some consider English to be one of the benefits of international courses for students, professors, and academics; Bryła (2019), for example, considers the main benefits for international students to be improving their foreign language skills, finding international friends, strengthening one's intercultural understanding, being more active, independent, and confident. Many studies have focused on improving students' English in these study courses and the need for such courses in their international curriculum (Poce, Re & Amenduni, 2018; Halic, Greenberg & Paulus, 2009; Galloway & Ruegg, 2020).

In addition to personal and professional development, the cultural impact that these courses have had on participants can lead to the cultural development of the academic system through a positive scientific approach and international cultural interactions. The values that the participants in the target countries encountered, and which were explicitly stated in their statements, may indicate the lack or scarcity of these values in the country's scientific environment; and by restoring these values in the context of academic discourse, we can hope for its emergence in the future. Research has shown that culture plays a key role in building community education. Culture is essential in teaching and learning for the advancement of faculty members and learners; it has become an active factor in the internationalization of higher education (Sun et al, 2019). Orth (2015) also state in a study that Saudi international students in interviews cited their level of intercultural competence as one of their most

important international experiences (Vogel et al, 2019). Other studies (Sablina, Soong & Pechurina, 2018; Wu & Naidoo, 2016) have highlighted the importance of cultural influences on the periods of internationalization.

In general, and for the satisfaction of Ph.D. students, educational institutions and universities design and implement specific programs to improve supervision, coaching, and educational activities for Ph.D. students (Galloway & Ruegg, 2020); therefore, the 100% emphasis of the participants on the necessity of continuing short-term research courses abroad can determine its importance and level of effectiveness. This highlights the need for policymakers and principal educators to pay special attention to study opportunities, redesign it based on years of managerial experience, and to the experiences of students and professors, and to continuously evaluate its effectiveness. The themes extracted in this qualitative study can be seen as variables for predicting and making sound policy decisions on the one hand, and increasing the level of satisfaction of scholarship students with the opportunity to study on the other hand. Finally, by increasing the level of quality of services of the Ministry of Science and the satisfaction of the expatriate students, we will see the more social impact of this phenomenon.

6. Conclusion

Universities around the world have crucial role in sustainable development. One of the most important stakeholders at the university is student. So, the process of educating and set of curricula is so important. In the curriculum implementation stage some activities like interactive among the students are important specially in international level. International experience in higher education is the most important factor. Therefore, student exchange is the suitable path for developing and improving of lived experience of students in higher education especially in post-graduate courses. This is why providing the international collaboration in higher education and organize the mutual programs and agreements among the universities is non-negotiable necessity. These cooperations can improve the competence-based curriculum in international labor market level. It also provides an invaluable opportunity for cross-culture communication and collaboration among the students and university professors.

References

Ahmad, S. Z., & Buchanan, F. R. (2016). Choices of destination for transnational higher education: "Pull" factors in an Asia Pacific market. Educational Studies, 42(2), 163–180.

Al-Kumaim, N. H., Hassan, S. H., Mahmood, A., Qureshi, M. I., & Khan, N. (2020). Exploring the Determinants that Control Information Overload and Postgraduate Research Performance: Conceptual Model and Implications for Future Research. International Journal of Psychosocial Rehabilitation, 24(01).

Appiah-Kubi, P., & Annan, E. (2020). A Review of a Collaborative Online International Learning. International Journal of Engineering Pedagogy (iJEP), 10(1), 109-124.

Atalar, A. (2020). Student Exchange: The First Step Toward International Collaboration. In Successful Global Collaborations in Higher Education Institutions (pp. 63-71). Springer, Cham.

Audenaert, M., Vanderstraeten, A., Buyens, D., & Desmidt, S. (2014). Does alignment elicit competency-based HRM? A systematic review. management revue, 5-26.

Bason, T., May, A., & LaFountaine, J. (2018). Exploring the attitudes of students undertaking sports degrees towards online international learning. Motriz: Revista de Educação Física, 24(3).

Bodycott, P. (2009). Choosing a higher education study abroad destination: what mainland Chinese parents and students rate as important. Journal of Research in International Education, 8, 349–373. https://doi. org/10.1177/1475240909345818.

Bradford, A. (2015). Internationalization policy at the genba: Exploring the implementation of social science English-taught undergraduate degree programs in three Japanese universities, Doctoral dissertation, The George Washington University.

Bryła, P. (2019). International student mobility and subsequent migration: the case of Poland. Studies in Higher Education, 44(8), 1386-1399.

Buchem, I., Konert, J., Carlino, C., Casanova, G., Rajagopal, K., Firssova, O., et al. (2018). Designing a Collaborative Learning Hub for Virtual Mobility Skills: Insights from the European Project Open Virtual Mobility. In International Conference on Learning and Collaboration Technologies (pp. 350-375). Springer, Cham.

Cattaneo, M., Horta, H., Malighetti, P., Meoli, M., & Paleari, S. (2019). Universities' attractiveness to students: The Darwinism effect. Higher Education Quarterly, 73(1), 85-99.

Daquila, T.C. (2013). Internationalizing Higher Education in Singapore: Government Policies and the NUS Experience. Journal of Studies in International Education. Reprints and permissions: sagepub.com/journalsPermissions.nav DOI: 10.1177/1028315313499232 jsi.sagepub.com.

De Oliveira, D. B., & Soares, A. M. (2016). Studying abroad: Developing a model for the decision process of international students. Journal of Higher Education Policy and Management, 38(2), 126–139. doi: 10.1080/1360080X.2016.1150234.

Durkin, M., & McKenna, S. (2011). Informing the marketing of higher education to younger people. Irish Marketing Review, 21(1), 41-47.

Elango, B., Kozak, M., & Rajendran, P. (2019). Analysis of retractions in Indian science. Scientometrics, 119(2), 1081-1094.

Gajić, J. (2012). Importance of marketing mix in higher education institutions. Singidunum Journal of Applied Sciences, 9(1), 29-41.

Galloway, N., & Ruegg, R. (2020). The provision of student support on English Medium Instruction programmes in Japan and China. Journal of English for Academic Purposes, 45, 100846.

Gong, X., & Huybers, T. (2015). Chinese students and higher education destinations: Findings from a choice experiment. Australian Journal of Education, 59(2), 196–218. doi: 10.1177/0004944115584482.

Halic, O., Greenberg, K and Paulus, T. (2009) Language and Academic Identity: a study of the experiences of non-native English-speaking international students. International Education, 38(2): 73-93.

Hildén, M. (2011). International Students' Decision-Making Process. Available on: http://www.doria.fi/bitstream/handle/10024/77326/kandidaatintutkielma-internationalstudents'decision-makingprocess.pdf?sequence=1

Jiani, M. A. (2017). Why and how international students choose Mainland China as a higher education study abroad destination. Higher Education, 74(4), 563-579.

Khalid, J., Ali, A. J., Islam, M. S., Khaleel, M., & Shu, Q. F. (2017). Internationalization as Investment for Higher Education Institutions: Introducing a Framework to Enhance Investment in Internalization Practices. Review of Social Sciences, 2(2), 01-11.

Lee, J. T., & Kuzhabekova, A. (2018). Reverse flow in academic mobility from core to periphery: motivations of international faculty working in Kazakhstan. Higher Education, 76(2), 369-386.

Lee, J. Y., & Park, S. (2017). Analysis of critical success factors of online international learning exchange of Korean school pupils with English-speaking counterparts. British Journal of Educational Technology, 48(6), 1228-1238.

Lee, S. W. (2017). Circulating east to east: understanding the push-pull factors of Chinese students studying in Korea. Journal of Studies in International Education, 21(1), 170–190.

Li, X., Zhao, N., & Li, Y. (2019). Research on the Construction of Higher Education Evaluation System. In 2019 International Conference on Management, Education Technology and Economics (ICMETE 2019). Atlantis Press.

Liu, Y., Kamnuansilpa, P., & Hirofumi, A. (2018). Factors Affecting International Students' Decisions on Destination for Studying Abroad: A Case Study in China. Frontiers of Education in China, 13, 93-118.

Mazzarol, T., & Soutar, G.N. (2002). "Push-pull" factors influencing international student destination choice. International Journal of Educational Management, 16(2), 82–90. doi: 10.1108/09513540210418403.

Mehrvarz, M., Salimi, G., Mohammadi, M., Shafiei Sarvestani, M., & Hatami, J. (2019). Identification of Effective Strategies in Facilitating Virtual Mobility. Interdisciplinary Journal of Virtual Learning in Medical Sciences, 10(2), 14-22.

Minola, T., Donina, D., & Meoli, M. (2016). Students climbing the entrepreneurial ladder: Does university internationalization pay off? Small Business Economics, 3(47), 565-587.

Orth, A. M. (2015). International students' perceptions of their experience of higher education in Australia: A focus on Saudi Arabian students in their first year of a business course in a major Australian university (Doctoral dissertation, Queensland University of Technology).

Otto, D. (2018). The challenge of virtual mobility: pedagogical models and good practices. In International Technology, Education and Development Conference. 3368-3376.

Owens, A., & Loomes, S. (2010). Managing and resourcing a program of social integration initiatives for international university students: What are the benefits? Journal of Higher Education Policy and Management, 32(3), 275–290.

Pigini, C., & Staffolani, S. (2016). Beyond participation: do the cost and quality of higher education shape the enrollment composition? The case of Italy. Higher education, 71(1), 119-142.

Ploner, J. (2018). International students' transitions to UK Higher Education–revisiting the concept and practice of academic hospitality. Journal of Research in International Education, 17(2), 164-178.

Poce, A., Re, M. R., & Amenduni, F. (2018). Virtual and Mobility Activities to Promote Dual Learning Approach in Higher Education: The Euroduale Project Experience. Towards Personalized Guidance and Support for Learning, 59.

Pouromid, S. (2019). Towards multimodal interactions in the multilingual EFL classroom: Lessons from a COIL experience. Indonesian Journal of Applied Linguistics, 8(3), 627-637.

Reiner, C., Meyer, S., & Sardadvar, S. (2017). Urban attraction policies for international academic talent: Munich and Vienna in comparison. Cities, 61, 27-35.

Renfors, S. M., Veliverronena, L., & Grinfelde, I. (2020). Developing tourism curriculum content to support international tourism growth and competitiveness: An example from the central Baltic area. Journal of Hospitality & Tourism Education, 32(2), 124-132.

Rivera, M. (2019). Peruvian consumer research about decision-making and evaluation of higher education alternatives abroad.

Roga, R., Lapiņa, I., & Müürsepp, P. (2015). Internationalization of higher education: Analysis of factors influencing foreign students' choice of higher education institution. Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences, 213, 925-930.

Ruhanen, L., & Bowles, L. (2019). Student Perspectives of Responsible Tourism Behaviour: The Role of Tourism Education. Journal of Hospitality & Tourism Education, 1-11.

Sablina, S., Soong, H., & Pechurina, A. (2018). Exploring expectations, experiences and long-term plans of Chinese international students studying in the joint Sino-Russian degree. Higher Education, 1-16.

Spiro, Jane. (2014). "Learning Interconnectedness: Internationalisation through Engagement with One Another." Higher Education Quarterly 68 (1): 65–84.

Starck, K., & Zadeh, S. H. (2013). Marketing within higher education institutions-A case study of two private Thai universities. Master Thesis, in Business Administration, Mälardalen University, The School of Business, Science and Engineering. Retrieved from: http://www.diva-portal.org/smash/get/diva2:625908/FULLTEXT02.pdf

Sun, Q., Kang, H., Chang, B., & Lausch, D. (2019). Teaching international students from Confucian Heritage Culture countries: perspectives from three US host campuses. Asia Pacific Education Review, 20(4), 559-572.

Teresevičienė, M., Volungevičienė, A., & Daukšienė, E. (2011). Virtual mobility for teachers and students in higher education: comparative research study on virtual mobility. Teacher Virtual Campus: Research, Practice, Apply.

Thalib, S. (2015). The Effect of Services Marketing Mix and Customer Value on Satisfaction, Trust, and Loyalty. International Journal, 3(9), 935-949.

Trencher, G., Bai, X., Evans, J., McCormick, K., & Yarime, M. (2014). University partnerships for co-designing and co-producing urban sustainability. Global Environmental Change, 28, 153-165.

Tur, G., Urbina, S., Firssova, O., Rajagopal, K., & Buchem, I. (2018). Open Virtual Mobility: A Learning Design 4 SRL. Paper presented at EDEN Research Workshop 2018, Barcelona, Spain.

Valtins, K., & Muracova, N. (2019). Virtual mobility for students, going from distance learning to live participation. Periodicals of Engineering and Natural Sciences, 7(1), 222-227.

Vogel, C., Diegel, N., Firssova, O., Kananen, P., Stracke, C. M., & Brouns, F. (2019). Studying in a Virtual Mobility Context: An International Pilot in the Domain of Educational Science. In G. Ubachs (Ed.), The Envisioning Report for Empowering Universities: 3rd edition (pp. 20-22). Maastricht: European Association of Distance Teaching Universities (EADTU).

Wihlborg, M., Friberg, E. E., Rose, K. M., & Eastham, L. (2018). Facilitating learning through an international virtual collaborative practice: A case study. Nurse education today, 61, 3-8.

Wright, R. (2014). Student focused marketing: Impact of marketing higher education based on student data and input. College Student Journal, 48(1), 88-93.

Wu, H., & Zha, Q. (2018). A new typology for analyzing the direction of movement in higher education internationalization. Journal of Studies in International Education, 22(3), 259-277.

Wu, T., & Naidoo, V. (2016). The Role of International Marketing in Higher Education. International Marketing of Higher Education, 3–9. DOI: 10.1057/978-1-137-54291-5_1

Yang, K., & Lee, H. (2018). Quantifying Quality: Research Performance Evaluation in Korean Universities. Journal of Information Science Theory and Practice, 6(3), 45-60.

Zeegers, Y., & Clark, I. F. (2014). Students' perceptions of education for sustainable development. International Journal of Sustainability in Higher Education.

Zizka, L., & Varga, P. (2020). Teaching Sustainability in Higher Education Institutions: Assessing Hospitality Students' Sustainability Literacy. Journal of Hospitality & Tourism Education, 1-16.